

RESEARCH ARTICLE

A Study on the Different Original Versions Used in the Translation of *Hong Lou Meng* by Yang Xianyi and Gladys Yang

Received: 15 July 2022; Revised: 30 November 2022; Published: 14 December 2022

Yuanqiong Wu

Shanghai University of Engineering Science, China
Email: ellen5@163.com
<https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5283-4248>

Xiaomin Liu

Shanghai University of Engineering Science, China
Email: xmluuk@163.com

Abstract:

Hong Lou Meng is a classical Chinese novel with worldwide influence. It is a canon with a fluid text—the multiple versions of the novel; as a result, has posed huge challenges to translators. The fluid text is also the source of conflicting statements about the original versions used by Yang Xianyi (1915-2009) and his wife Gladys Yang (1919-1999) in their translation of the novel. Different parties involved in the translation, including Yang Xianyi—the translator, Wu Shichang—the then English editor, and the Foreign Languages Press—the publisher of the Yangs' complete translation *Hong Lou Meng*, reported differently on the original versions. Due to its prominent importance in Chinese culture, *Hong Lou Meng* represents the status quo of Chinese literature in the global community. The Yangs' translation of *Hong Lou Meng* in 120 chapters, being one of the two published complete English translations of the novel, has been an important focus of study in both literature and translation. However, the diverse narrations on the original versions have not been resolved so far, and the identity of the original versions remains ambiguous, therefore, the study of the Yangs' translation has been impacted and mitigated. This work applies the methods of close textual reading and collation comparing the Yangs' translation excerpts published earlier in *Chinese Literature* with their later complete version of the novel; associating the translation practice with the then social background, therefore establishing the identity of the original versions used by the Yangs at different stages of their translation. This paper explores the factors that have influenced the Yangs' translation of *Hong Lou Meng*, as well as the impact of these factors on the significance of the novel.

Keywords: fluid text, *Hong Lou Meng*, original versions used in translation, Yang Xianyi and Gladys Yang

1. Introduction

Hong Lou Meng (HLM) is a masterpiece of classical Chinese literature written in the 18th century. It is a canon with many defects, and one of which is its incompleteness with a fluid text. According to Byrant (2002:2), a fluid text is “any literary work that exists in more than one version”, and a text is fluid because “versions flow from one to another”. Bryant also points out that the multiplicity of versions is not a theory, but a fact, and it is “the nature of literary phenomenon”, also it is “something



to celebrate, to interpret, and study” (ibid:4). Among the multiple versions of *HLM*, variations ranging from wording, character names, timelines and completeness in contents, to coherence of plots appear in various places throughout the novel. The fluid text of *HLM* poses a great challenge to the translators, especially to those who are to translate the novel as a whole in 120 chapters. The choice of the original content is of great importance to the translation work, as it reflects not only the translators’ interpretation of the novel but also the translation ethics. Therefore, how the translators addressed the issue of fluid text is worth studying.

The fluid text of *HLM* led to the conflicting statements about the original version(s) used by Yang Xianyi (1915-2009), a Chinese translator, and his wife Gladys Yang (1919-1999), an English native, in their translating of the novel. Different parties involved, including Yang Xianyi—the translator, Wu Shichang—the then English editor, and the Foreign Languages Press—the publisher of the Yangs’ complete translation of *HLM*, reported differently on the original versions. Since the publication of the Yangs’ translation of four decades years ago, scholastic interests in uncovering the identity of the original versions have always focused on the collation of the Yangs’ 1978-1980 complete translation and the diverse original versions. Little or no references were made to the published extracts of the Yangs’ translation in the journal of *Chinese Literature* in 1964, 1974, 1977. These extracts are important in that they correspond to different periods of the Yangs’ translation activity, thus shedding light on their translation process, including their choices of the original versions and the underlying reasons. The current research, by collating the excerpts published by *Chinese Literature*, the complete translation, and the original version texts, aims to identify any change of original versions used by the Yangs throughout the translation process, and explore the influence of social factors on their translation of *HLM*. The research questions are:

- 1) Why do different parties involved in the translation activity have different narrations on the original versions used by the Yangs in their translation of *HLM*?
- 2) What are the original versions of the extracts published by *Chinese Literature* in 1964, 1974, 1977, and 1978-1980 complete translation?
- 3) How does the choice change of the original versions over the time reveal and relate to the impacting factors in the Yangs’ translation process?

This paper begins with an introduction to the diverse original versions of *HLM*, followed by a review of the conflicting claims over the original versions used by the Yangs, and scholars’ response. The fourth and fifth parts are a study of the original versions of extracts published by *Chinese Literature* and the 1978-1980 complete version. The sixth part is an analysis of the factors affecting the choice change of original versions and their impact on the translation, followed by the conclusion.

2. The Original Versions of *HLM*

HLM is a literary canon with many versions in the original language of Chinese. According to the opening chapter of the novel, *HLM* was originally a story recorded on a stone at the foot of Blue Ridge Peak (青埂峰) in Great Waste Mountain (大荒山), which was passed down through different hands, in the titles of *The Tale of the Stone*, *Record of the Passionate Monk*, *Hong Lou Meng* and *Precious*



Mirror of Love at different times (Tsao,2009:16) (甲戌本). Among these contributors, Tsao Hsueh-chin(1715-1763) in Qing Dynasty (1644-1911) “rewrote it in five times”, “divided it into chapters, furnished headings for each, and renamed it *The Twelve Beauties of Chinling*”. Afterward, Zhi Yan Zhai (脂砚斋), a key commentator of the novel at Tsao Hsueh-chin’s time resumed the title of novel as *The Tale of the Stone*.

HLM is an incomplete novel, for Tsao Hsueh-chin died before he finished the novel, which is borne out by one annotation made by Ji Hu Sou(畸笏叟), a senior family member (ibid). While working on the novel, Tsao Hsueh-chin sent the manuscripts to his families and close friends, and the manuscripts were returned with suggestions for revisions and with pages missing too. For instance, in one annotation made by Zhi Yan Zhai (ibid: 274), it records that:

秦可卿淫丧天香楼 作者用史笔也 老朽因有魂托凤姐贾家后事二件 嫡是安富尊荣坐享人能想得到处 其事虽未漏 其言其意则令人悲切感服 姑赦之 因命芹溪删去ⁱ

This annotation is about the plot on the death of Chin Ko-ching (秦可卿), one of the twelve beauties in the novel. From this annotation, it could be inferred that in the original manuscript, Ko-ching died of shame after her adultery with her father-in-law was exposed. Giving the fact that Ko-ching once delivered a warning message about the Chia Household (贾家) to Wang Hsi-feng (王熙凤), Zhi Yan Zhai asked Tsao Hsueh-chin to remove the adultery part. The result is that in today’s versions, Ko-ching died of an incurable disease, not hanging herself in Tian Xiang Pavilion (天香楼) as was indicated in the original manuscript. In some other annotations, both Zhi Yan Zhai and Ji Hu Sou mentioned the fact of pages missing when the novel was returned from earlier readers (此后破失 佚再补) (Tsao,2009:506) (庚辰本). Some of the missing pages were rewritten by the author Tsao Hsueh-chin, while others were added by book collectors, booksellers, and even readers of later generations. This contributes to the existence of diverse versions of *HLM* in manuscript form. According to Wei Shaochang (1982:57), there are 12 different manuscript versions of *HLM* unearthed so far. Most of them contain less than 80 chapters, while Mongolia version (蒙古王府本) and Yang version (杨藏本) contain 120 chapters. The Zheng version (郑振铎藏本) contains the least, only two chapters. Jia Xu version (甲戌本), Yi Mao version (乙卯本) and Geng Chen version (庚辰本) were revised in 1754, 1759, and 1760 respectively, years before the death of Tsao Hsueh-chin, so they were believed to be the closest to the author’s original writing.

In 1791, a printed version of *HLM* in 120 chapters was published by Cui Wen Shu Wu (翠文书屋), and this version is now known as Cheng A version (程甲本). This version was edited by Cheng Weiyuan (程伟元) and Gao E (高鹗). The following year, a new version, a revision of Cheng A was published, and it is known as Cheng B version (程乙本). The publication of these two versions promoted the circulation of *HLM* as a complete novel, and on their basis, many new versions were published afterwards. Both Cheng A and B versions hold numerous differences with the manuscript versions, some of which concern the main plots of the story, such as the tales about the relationship between the stone and the attendant Shen Ying (神瑛侍者) in the Palace of Red Jade (赤瑕宫). The



manuscript versions, such as the Geng Chen, Yang and Jia Xu versions do not associate the attendant with the stone, whereas the Cheng versions do.

All these different hands mentioned here, together with the editors in modern times, contributed to the coexistence of diverse versions of *HLM* today. In the history of translating this novel, especially for translating the novel in its entirety of 120 chapters, choice of original version is of great importance to the translation work. As the British translator David Hawkes (1989:159) once said:

“.....in the case of this particular novel, almost any choice between different versions of the text may involve the translator in decisions about a number of quite fundamental questions—questions concerning the authorship of the novel, its evolution, the identity of the commentators, the credibility of the early editors, the nature of their editing, and so forth.”

3. Conflicting Statements over the Original Version(s) Used by the Yangs

Yang Xianyi and his wife Gladys Yang started to translate *HLM* in the early 1960s. However, their translation journey was bumpy. In 1964, the Yangs finished translating almost the first 100 chapters, but as the Cultural Revolution (1966-1976) was looming, their work was called to a stop in 1965. The Yangs resumed their work in 1972 and finished translating *HLM* in 120 chapters in 1974. The Yangs' complete translation was published in three volumes by the Foreign Languages Press in 1978 and 1980 respectively. However, soon after these publications, the issue around the choice of the original versions emerged, for different concerned parties made different statements on the original versions used by the Yangs. First, the *Publisher's Note* of Volume I (1978:ix) of the Yangs' complete translation states:

Our first eighty chapters have been translated from the Photostat edition published by the People's Literature Publishing House, Peking, in September 1973 according to a lithographic edition printed by the Yu-cheng Press, Shanghai, in about 1911. This Yu-cheng edition had been made from a manuscript copy kept by Chi Liao-sheng of the Chien-lung era. The last forty chapters are based on the 120-chapter edition reprinted by the People's Literature Publishing House, Peking, in 1959 from the movable-type edition of 1792. The Chi Liao-sheng manuscript of the first eighty chapters is one of the earliest copies extant. In our translation certain minor errors and omissions made by the man who copied the original manuscript have been corrected according to other versions.

To put it simply, this *Note* states that the original version for the first 80 chapters is from a manuscript copy kept by Chi Liao-sheng (戚廖生) of the Qian-lung (乾隆) era. This version is currently referred to as Qi version (戚序本) or Yu-cheng version (有正本) (“Yu-cheng” version would be used in this paper). The *Note* says the original version for the last 40 chapters is from Cheng B version.

However, a few months after the Yangs' complete translation of *HLM* was officially published, *Renmin Ribao* (人民日报) (1979) reported the event. As to the original versions, the report reads:

经过慎重研究，译本前八十回依据北京图书馆珍藏的抄本[脂京本]，后四十回依据[程甲本]。

According to this news report, the Yangs used the version “脂京本” housed in Peking Library for the first 80 chapters, and Cheng A version for the last 40 chapters. “脂京本” is a manuscript version,



with annotations made by Zhi Yan Zhai, and it is currently housed at Peking University Library (the report made a mistake here by saying that it is housed in Peking Library). As there are such notes in the book as “庚辰秋月定本” (finished in autumn of Geng Chen year), this version is now referred to as Geng Chen version. The original versions reported here are obviously in conflict with the aforementioned *Publisher's Note*. Wu Shichang, the then English editor of the Yangs' translation first observed the deviation. Wu (1980: 79) confirmed that the Yangs used Geng Chen version in translating the first 80 chapters and Cheng A version in translating the last 40 chapters of *HLM*.

To make the issue even more complicated, the translator Yang Xianyi noted quite differently about the original versions he and his wife used in translating *HLM*. In a letter to his friend, Yang Xianyi gave the following narration (Qin Ying, 2016: 142) on the original versions as:

“秦颖同志，关于《红楼梦》的版本问题，是这样的。外文局在‘文革’前（大概是六一年左右）要我们译红楼梦根据一百二十回通行本，才译了一部分，‘文革’开始了，当时江青要抓红楼梦的英译问题，告诉外文局，译文前六十回要根据八十回本改正，所以又重新根据当时俞平伯校订的八十回本改译（俞校订本也是人民文学社出版的）。”

According to this letter, Yang Xianyi and his wife Gladys Yang first based their translation on a popular 120-chapter version of *HLM*. However, when the Cultural Revolution (1966-1976) started, Jiang Qing, Chairman Mao's wife, mandated that the first 60 chapters be translated from a 80-chapter version of *HLM*. So, they re-translated *HLM* from Yu version. That is to say, there was a change of original versions during the Yangs' process of translation. The popular 120-chapter version first used by the Yangs was not specified, but the version annotated by Yu Pingbo was an influential one in the 1960s. It is an eclectic one, mainly a collation of such versions as Geng Chen, Yi Mao (乙卯本) and Jia Xu (甲戌本), with reference to Jia Chen (甲辰本), Zheng (郑振铎藏本), and Cheng A and B versions. Yu version (俞校本) was first published in four volumes (the first two being the contents of the first 80 chapters, the third being the detailed records of Yu's collation, the fourth being an appendix of the last 40 chapters) by the People's Literature Publishing House in 1958. Yang Xianyi restated his choice of the original version in an interview with Qian Duoxiu & E.S.P. Almberg (2001:19):

Q: There are many versions of *Honglouloumeng*. Which version did you base your translation on? Why?

A: Wu Shichang helped to decide on the Chinese version because he was an authority on *Honglouloumeng*. According to him, I should translate only the first 80 chapters. But then, Jiangqing, Chairman Mao's wife, interfered and said all the 120 chapters should be translated. We had to agree. So we chose the first 80 chapters of *Honglouloumeng* annotated by Yu Pingbo and the next 40 chapters in the popular version published by the People's Literature Press.



The conflicting statements over the original versions could be summarized in Table 1:

Table 1. The Conflicting Views over Original Versions Used by the Yangs in their Translation of *HLM*

Different parties	First 80 chapters	Last 40 chapters
<i>Publisher's Note</i> of 1978 Version	Yu-cheng version (published in 1973)	Cheng B version (published in 1959)
<i>Renmin Ribao</i>	Geng Chen version	Cheng A version
Wu Shichang	Geng Chen version	Cheng A version
Yang Xianyi	A popular 120 version (before Jiang Qing's interference); Yu version (after Jiang Qing's interference)	A popular 120 version

Unfortunately, the coexistence of fluid texts of *HLM* and these conflicting statements over the choice of the original versions were not taken seriously, and many studies of the novel translation were conducted on the premises that all the translated texts were based on the same single original version, thus sully the reputation of the translated texts, as well as that of the novel itself (Hong: 2010). Therefore, academic research has been conducted to unveil the identity of the original versions used by the Yangs. Li Jing has written extensively on this issue. Li Jing (2013), examined the details concerning dietary and medicine, aspects concerning poetry, calligraphy and painting (2014), and concluded that the original versions used by the Yangs were Yu-cheng version and Geng Chen version. The Yangs incorporated the contents from these two versions as the original version of their translation. In 2015, by examining chapter titles, chapter divisions, variants in contents, details in dialogues and poets, Li Jing argued that the original version used by the Yangs was not Yu version. In 2020, in her monograph *A Study of the Original Version(s) Used by Yang Xianyi and Gladys Yang in their Translation of Hong Lou Meng*, Li Jing concluded that the original version used by the Yangs is neither Yu-cheng version, Yu version, nor Geng Chen version, but an eclectic version incorporating the contents of different versions, known as the Yang-Dai version (杨戴本) (2020: 242). Wang Jinbo (2019) conducted a research about the original version of the last 40 chapters and concluded that the main original versions used by the Yangs were Cheng B version and Yu version, with reference to Cheng A version.

It is observed that different concerned parties: the publisher, the English editor, and the translator hold different views on the original versions. Who is right? Or if each view is justified, what are their justifications? Li Jing and Wang Jinbo have conducted detailed research about the original versions, but both have focused exclusively on the 1978-1980 complete version of the Yangs' translation, and not included the earlier translated excerpts in their research framework. Consequently, the underlying reasons of these conflicting views, and then, the real process of the Yangs' translation, remain unexplored.



4. The Original Versions of *HLM* Excerpts Published by *Chinese Literature*

Chinese Literature (《中国文学》) was an English journal established in the early 1950s, and the purpose of this journal was to introduce important Chinese literary works in English. The Yangs worked closely with *Chinese Literature*, and many of their translations were published by this journal, among which were their translated excerpts of *HLM*. The Yangs' excerpts of *HLM* were published on Issues 6, 7 and 8 of *Chinese Literature* (1964), Issue 5 of *Chinese Literature* (1974), and Issues 11 and 12 of *Chinese Literature* (1977). 1964, 1974, and 1977 are important time points in the Yangs' translation of *HLM*, for they correspond to different periods in their translation work (Table 2). In this study, the Yangs' journey of translating *HLM* is divided into four stages. Stage 1 refers to the period in which the Yangs translated almost the first 100 chapters of *HLM* without being interrupted, from 1961 when they accepted the task to 1965 when their translation was called to a stop; Stage 2 refers to the period in which the Yangs resumed their translation, from 1972 when they were released from prison to 1974 when they finished translating the complete 120 chapters of *HLM*; Stage 3 refers to the period in which the Yangs revised their translation, from 1975 to 1977, one year before the first two volumes of their complete translation were published. Stage 4 refers to the period in which the Yangs finalized the translation from 1978-1980.

Table 2. The Yangs' Translated Excerpts of *HLM* Published by *Chinese Literature*

Translation Stages		Publishing Year in <i>Chinese Literature</i>		Contents
<i>Chinese Literature</i> Issues	Stage 1	1964	Issue 6	Chapters 18, 19, 20
			Issue 7	Chapters 32, 33, 34
			Issue 8	Chapters 74, 75, 77
	Stage 2	1974	Issue 5	Chapter 4
	Stage 3	1977	Issue 11	Chapters 27, 28
			Issue 12	Chapters 40, 41
Complete Version	Stage 4	1978-1980	—	The Corresponding Chapters of Excerpts from <i>Chinese Literature</i>

In this part, the first three stages were examined. We first collated the different original versions mentioned by different parties (including Yu-cheng, Geng Chen, Yu, Cheng A and B versions), to locate the textual differences between them. Then, we collated the translated versions in different periods with these original versions, to identify the original versions used by the translators in different periods. To achieve this purpose, we ignored the differences concerning variants of the same words, as well as the differences that were not traced in the translated texts. Instead, we used the differences that were explicit in translated texts as examples for analysis, which fall into the following categories: 1) figures/numbers; 2) character names; 3) specific items; 4) chapter titles; 5) division of chapters; 6) presence or absence of certain contents.



4.1 Original version(s) of the 1964 excerpts

Chinese Literature published three excerpts of the Yangs' translation of *HLM*, all together nine chapters at Issues 6, 7, and 8 in 1964. They were published in the same year when the Yangs finished translating almost the first 100 chapters of *HLM*, the first stage of the Yangs' translation work. In this section, we focus on the collation of Issue 6, with a brief summary on the other two issues, due to the limit on the length of this paper.

4.1.1 Titles, beginnings and endings

Issue 6 contains the Yangs' translation of Chapter 18, 19, and 20. Chapter 18 is entitled as:

Yuan-chun Returns to Lord Jung's Mansion to Visit Her Parents

They Celebrate the Feast of Lanterns

Translated back into Chinese, this title is “元春归省荣国府 他们共庆元宵节”. The corresponding titles for Chapter 18 in original versions are shown in Table 3:

Table 3. Titles for Chapter 18

Yu-cheng version	<u>庆元宵贾元春归省 助情人林黛玉传诗</u>
Geng Chen /Yu versions (Chapter 17 and 18 not divided)	<u>大观园试才题对额 荣国府归省庆元宵</u>
Cheng versions	<u>皇恩重元妃省父母 天伦乐宝玉呈才藻</u>

The Yangs' title for Chapter 18 is only partially reflected in the underlined titles from the original versions, and it could be inferred that the Yangs' translation of Chapter 18 title was neither based on Yu-cheng nor Cheng versions, but either Geng Chen or Yu versions where Chapter 17 and 18 were not divided.

The Yangs' beginning of Chapter 18 also confirmed this inference. The Yangs' Chapter 18 begins with:

For Lady Wang and her helpers the days passed in a flurry of preparations until, towards the end of the tenth month, all was ready.

The corresponding original text for this beginning is “王夫人等日日忙乱，直到十月将尽，幸皆全备”. This beginning is different from that of Yu-cheng version which opens with pages talking with Chia Pao-yu “却说宝玉来至院外 就有跟贾政的几个小厮上来 拦腰抱住 都说 今儿亏我们 老爷才喜欢”. The Yangs' beginning does not conform to that of Cheng versions which open with Wang Hsi-feng opening the storeroom to issue gauze and silk needed by the workmen for screens “话说彼时有人回，工程上等着糊东西的纱绫，请凤姐去开库”. The Yangs' beginning appears at roughly 57 % lines of Chapter 17 and 18 in both Geng Chen and Yu versions, so it could be inferred that the Yangs' division of Chapter 18 is the result of judgment from the original undivided 17-18 Chapter.



The Yangs' ending for Chapter 18 is:

The whole household did their best to console the Lady Dowager and Lady Wang as they helped them out of the garden. But more of this in the next chapter.

The corresponding original text for this ending is “这里诸人好容易将贾母王夫人安慰解劝搀扶出园去了。下回分解。” It is the same as in Yu-cheng and Yu versions, different from those in Cheng versions, which are “这里众人好容易将贾母劝住，及王夫人搀扶出园去了。未知如何，下回分解。” The ending for Chapter 18 in Geng Chen version is not complete, for it ends abruptly at “这里诸人好容易将贾母王夫人安慰解劝搀扶出园去了正是”. This unfinished ending echoes itself in Chapter 19 of Geng Chen version, where it ends with “刚说这里只听宝玉房中一片声嚷吵闹起来正是”. The Yangs' ending for Chapter 19 is complete “At that moment the sound of squabbling broke out in Pao-yu's apartments. What it was will be explained in the next chapter”, and it could be traced back to the original versions of Yu-cheng and Yu.

From these examinations of chapter titles, beginnings and endings, it is obvious that in terms of chapter titles, the Yangs' title for Chapter 18 conforms partially to those in Geng Chen and Yu versions, following the undivided 17-18 chapter. The Yangs' beginning for Chapter 18 also follows the undivided 17-18 Chapter in Geng Chen and Yu versions, while the endings for Chapter 18 and 19 could be traced back to Yu-cheng and Yu versions. Despite the different degrees of overlapping, there is a constant correspondence, and that is the Yangs' translation of titles, beginnings and endings conform to those in Yu version.

4.1.2 Detailed contents in Issue 6 of *Chinese Literature* (1964)

The detailed contents of Issue 6 also indicate complex correspondence to the original versions:

Table 4. Detailed Contents of the 1964 Excerpts and Corresponding Parts in the Original Versions

Example 1	
1964 version	The streets are jammed with people and <u>carriages</u> ; <u>horses and sedan-chairs are dashing in all directions</u> . <u>What if there's an accident?</u> This is no joke!
Yu-cheng version	街上人挤车碰 <u>马有个闪失</u> 也是顽得的
Geng Chen/Yu versions	街上人挤车碰， <u>马轿纷纷的</u> ， <u>若有个闪失</u> ，也是顽得的！
Cheng versions	街上人挤 <u>马</u> 碰， <u>有个闪失</u> ，这也是顽得的吗？
Example 2	
1964 version	His-jen gave a sardonic smile. “ <u>The fact that I'm fated to be a slave doesn't mean that all my relatives must be slaves too</u> . So you still want to choose some really pretty girls to come to your house.”
Yu-cheng version	袭人冷笑道 实在好的 该给你家作奴才么
Geng Chen/Yu/Cheng versions	袭人冷笑道：【我一个人是奴才命罢了，难道连我的亲戚都是奴才命不成！定还要拣实在好的丫头才往你家来？】



Example 3	
1964 version	The next time it came to his turn, he stood to win by tossing <u>seven</u> , but if he threw <u>six</u> Ying-erh after him could <u>win with no more than three</u> .
Yu-cheng version	赶着这盘正该自己 掷个 <u>六点</u> 下该莺儿掷 <u>三点</u> 就赢了
Geng Chen/Yu version	赶着这盘正该自己掷骰子，若掷个 <u>七点</u> 便赢；若掷个 <u>六点</u> ，下该莺儿掷 <u>三点</u> 就赢了。
Cheng A version	赶着这盘正该自己掷骰子 若掷个 <u>七点</u> 便赢 若掷个 <u>六点</u> 亦该赢莺儿掷 <u>三点</u> 就输了
Cheng B version	赶着这盘正该自己掷骰子，若掷个 <u>七点</u> 便赢了，若掷个 <u>六点</u> 也该赢， <u>掷个三点就输了</u> 。
Example 4	
1964 version	Pao-chai, Tai-yu and the other girls each received a set of new books, <u>a rare inkstone</u> and two pairs of gold and silver ingots of a new design.
Yu-cheng version	宝钗黛玉诸姊妹等每人新书一部 <u>宝砚一方</u>
Geng Chen/Yu /Cheng versions	宝钗黛玉诸姊妹等每人新书一部， <u>宝砚一方</u> ，新样格式金银钗二对
Example 5	
1964 version	Two eunuchs ushered in <u>Chia Sheh</u> and the men of the family to range themselves below the dais...
Yu-cheng/Yu version	礼仪太监二人引 <u>贾赦</u> 等于月台下排班。
Geng Chen version	礼仪太监二人引 <u>贾赦贾政</u> 等于月台下排班
Cheng A version	二太监引 <u>贾赦贾政</u> 等于月台下排班
Cheng B version	二太监引 <u>赦政</u> 等于月台下排班。
Example 6	
1964 version	The pleasure ground were named the Grand View Garden. The Arch Where the Phoenix Alights became Bamboo Lodge, “Crimson Fragrance and Green Jade” was changed to “Happy Red and Delightful Green,” <u>while the court was called Happy Red Court</u> . The Hall called Pure Fragrance of Alpinia and Iris was renamed Alpinia Park, the lodge with the motto “Approach to the Apricot Tavern” became Hempen-washing Cottage.
Yu-cheng version	大观园 有凤来仪 <u>赐名曰潇湘馆</u> 红香绿玉改怡红快绿 蘅芷清芬 <u>赐名曰蘅芜苑</u> 杏帘在望 <u>赐名曰瀟葛山庄</u>
Geng Chen version	大观园 有凤来仪 红香绿玉改作怡红快绿 蘅芷清芬 杏帘在望
Yu version/Cheng versions	【大观园】 【有凤来仪】 <u>赐名【潇湘馆】</u> 。【红香绿玉】改【怡红快绿】（即名曰【怡红院】）。【蘅芷清芬】 <u>赐名曰【蘅芜苑】</u> 。【杏帘在望】 <u>赐名曰【瀟葛山庄】</u> 。

In Example 1, the Yangs’ translation describes the vehicles in the streets, which include carriages, horses and sedan-chairs. They correspond to “车”，“马”，“轿” in Geng Chen and Yu versions. The



relevant texts in Yu-cheng version are “车”, “马”, and in Cheng versions are “人”, “马”. His-jen’s words in Example 2 correspond to the relevant contents in Geng Chen, Yu and Cheng versions, while the underlined part is missing in Yu-cheng version. Example 3 sees two groups of difference. The first group falls on the numbers of “seven”, “six”, “three”, among which the Yangs’ translation contains “七”, “六”, “三” in the original versions but the Yu-cheng version only has “六”, “三”. The second group falls on the word “win”, which corresponds to the “赢” in Geng Chen and Yu versions. The corresponding part in Cheng versions is “输” (to lose). In Example 4, “a rare inkstone” in the Yangs’ translation corresponds to “宝砚一方” in Geng Chen, Yu and Cheng versions, while the Yu-cheng version reads “宝镜一方” (a rare mirror). In Example 5, the Yangs’ translation mentions “Chia Sheh”, which is in correspondence with “贾赦” in Yu-cheng and Yu versions, while those in other listed original versions are “贾赦贾政” or “赦政”. In Example 6, the Yangs translated the name of a place as “Happy Red and Delightful Lodge”, which corresponds with “怡红院” in Yu and Cheng versions.

The above collation of Yangs’ translation and different original versions points to an obvious fact: different original versions correspond with the Yangs’ translation at different time points to different degrees, but Yu version can be regarded as the original version of 1964 excerpts in Issue 6 in terms of chapter title, division of chapters, and detailed information. Through detailed collation and comparison, this pattern is also observed in Issue 7 and Issue 8. Therefore, it could be concluded that the Yangs’ 1964 excerpts were based on Yu version.

4.2 Original version(s) of the 1974 excerpts

the Yangs’ translation of Chapter 4 of *HLM* was published in Issue 5 of *Chinese Literature* (1974). It is a partial translation of a 7-page story about Chia Yu-tsun (贾雨村) judging a manslaughter case when he was posted as prefect of Yingtien (应天府). The collation of this excerpt with original versions reveals that the original version used by the Yangs in 1974 is different from the one used in 1964. First of all, the titles for Chapter 4 in different original versions are almost the same: “薄命女偏逢薄命郎 葫芦僧乱判葫芦案” in Yu-cheng, Yu and Geng Chen versions, “薄命女偏逢薄命郎 葫芦僧判断葫芦案”; the only difference lies in “乱判” (misjudge) in the former and “判断” (judge) in the latter. The 1974 excerpts bear the title of “An Ill-fated Girl Meets an Ill-fated Man A Monk from Gourd Temple Muddles up a Case”. Superficially this title corresponds with that in Yu-cheng, Yu and Geng Chen versions. However, if the metaphorical meaning of “葫芦” (metaphor of 糊涂) is taken into consideration, the “判断” in Cheng versions could also be translated into “muddles up”. In this case, the title in 1974 excerpts is not revealing enough information about the original version. Second, the 1974 excerpts are a partial translation of Chapter 4, with the beginning and ending omitted, so the beginning and ending cannot be analyzed here. By analyzing 10 differences in the original versions, it is found that the 1974 excerpts correspond with Cheng versions, instead of Yu-cheng, Geng Chen and Yu versions (Table 5).



Table 5. Detailed Contents of the 1974 Excerpts and Corresponding Parts in the Original Versions

Example 7	
1974 version	I beg Your Honour to arrest the criminals and uphold the right. Then both the living and the dead will be everlastingly grateful.
Yu-cheng version	望大老爷拘拿凶犯 剪恶除凶 以救孤寡 死者感戴天地之恩不尽
Geng Chen /Yu versions	望大老爷拘拿凶犯，以救孤寡，死者感戴天地之恩不尽。
Cheng versions	求太老爷拘拿凶犯，以扶善良，存殁感激天恩不尽。
Example 8	
1974 version	He was about to issue warrants for the arrest of the criminals' relatives for interrogation, when a yamen runner standing by his table shot him a warning glance.
Yu-cheng version	因发籤差公人立刻将凶犯族人掣来拷问 令他们实供藏在何处 一面再动海捕文书 正要发籤时 只见案边立着一个门子 使眼色儿 不令他发籤之意
Geng Chen version	因发签差公人立刻将凶犯族中人拿来拷问 令他们实供藏在何处 一面再动海捕文书 未发签时 只见案边立的一个门子 使眼色儿 不令他发签之意
Yu version	因发籤差公人立刻将凶犯族人拿来拷问，令他们实供藏在何处；一面再动海捕文书。正要发籤时，只见案边立着一个门子，使眼色儿，不令他发籤。
Cheng versions	便发签差公人立刻将凶犯家属拿来拷问。只见案旁站着一个门子，使眼色不叫他发签。
Example 9	
1974 version	This runner had been a novice in Gourd Temple. When the fire left him stranded he decided that work in a yamen would be easier and, having had enough of monastic austerity, he had taken advantage of his youth to grow his hair again and get this post.
Yu-cheng version	原来这门子本是葫芦庙内一个小沙弥 因被火之后 无处安身 欲投别庙去修行 又耐不了清冷景况 因想这件生意到还轻省热闹 遂趁年纪蓄了发 充了门子
Geng Chen version	原来这门子本是葫芦庙内一个小沙弥 因被火之后 无处安身 欲投别庙去修行 又耐不得清凉景况 因想这件生意到还轻省热闹 遂趁年纪蓄了发 充了门子
Yu version	原来这门子本是葫芦庙内一个小沙弥，因被火之后，无处安身，欲投别庙去修行，又耐不了清冷景况，因想这件生意到还轻省热闹，遂趁年纪蓄了发，充了门子。
Cheng versions	原来这门子本是葫芦庙里一个小沙弥，因被火之后，无处安身，想这件生意到还轻省，耐不得寺院凄凉，遂趁年纪轻，蓄了发，充当门子。
Example 10	
1974 version	"We were friends in the days when I was hard up," said Yu-tsun. "Besides, this is my private office, so why not sit down?"
Yu-cheng / Geng	雨村笑道：【贫贱之交不可忘，你我故人也；二则此系私室，既欲长谈，岂有不



Chen/Yu versions	坐之理】。
Cheng versions	雨村笑道：【你也算贫贱之交了；此系私室，但坐不妨】。
Example 11	
The Yangs' translation	“Officials' Life-preserver? What do you mean?” “All local officials nowadays keep a secret list of the most powerful, wealthy and high-ranking families in their province”.
Yu-cheng /Geng Chen/Yu versions	雨村忙问：【何为[护官符]?我竟不知。】门子道：【 <u>这还了得！连这个不知，怎能做得长远！</u> 如今凡做地方官者，皆有一个私单，上面写的是本省最有权势极富贵大乡绅的名姓，各省皆然.....】
Cheng versions	雨村忙问：【何为[护官符]】？门子道：【如今凡作地方官的都有一个私单，上面写的是本省最有权势极富贵的大乡绅名姓，各省皆然.....】
Example 12	
1974 version	It was a doggerel catalogue of the most notable families in that district. It started off:
Yu-cheng version	看时 皆是本地大族名宦之家的俗谚口碑 <u>其口碑排写得明白 下面皆注着始祖官爵并房次云</u>
Geng Chen/Yu versions	看时，皆是本地大族名宦之家的俗谚口碑。 <u>其口碑排写得明白，下面皆注着始祖官爵并房次，</u> 石头亦曾抄写了一张，今据石上所抄云：
Cheng versions	看时，上面皆是本地大族名宦之家的俗谚口碑，云：
Example 13	
1974 version	The man who was killed, Feng Yuan, was the son of one of the minor local gentry. Both his parents were dead and he had no brothers.
Yu-cheng /Geng Chen/Yu versions	这个被打之人乃是本地一个小乡宦之子，名唤冯渊， <u>自幼父母早亡，又无兄弟.....</u>
Cheng versions	这个被打死的乃是一个小乡宦之子，名唤冯渊，父母俱亡，又无兄弟.....
Example 14	
1974 version	Kidnappers of this type make a point of stealing small girls. They keep them till they're twelve or thirteen, then take them to another district to sell. We used to play with Ying-lien every day, so I knew her very well; and although seven or eight years have passed since then, as soon as I saw her I could tell it was her.
Yu-cheng /Yu versions	这种拐子单管偷拐五六岁的儿女 <u>养在一个静僻之处 到十一二岁时 度其容貌 带至他乡转卖 当日他这英莲 我们天天哄他玩耍 虽隔了七八年 如今十二三岁的光景 其模样虽然出脱得齐整好些 然大概自是不改 熟人易认</u>
Geng Chen version	这种拐子单管偷拐五六岁的儿女 <u>养在一个静僻之处 到十一二岁时 度其容貌 带至他乡转卖 当日这菊英 我们天天哄他玩耍 虽隔了七八年 如今十二三岁的光景 其模样虽然出脱得齐整好些 然大概相貌自是不改 熟人自然认得</u>
Cheng versions	这种拐子单拐幼女，养至十二三岁，带至他乡转卖。当日这英莲，我们天天哄她



	玩耍，极相熟的，所以隔了七八年，虽模样出脱得齐整，然大段未改，所以认得.....
Example 15	
1974 version	...that since this trouble was caused by the kidnapper, he must be dealt with according to the law, but no one else is involved...and so on and so forth.
Yu-cheng / Geng Chen /Yu versions	其祸皆由拐子某人而起； <u>所拐之人原系某乡某姓人氏</u> ；按例处治，余不累及等语。
Cheng versions	其祸皆由拐子而起，除将拐子按法处治外，余不累及等语。
Example 16	
1974 version	Tacitly, in fact, they were both agreed on this plan.
Yu-cheng/ Geng Chen/ Yu versions	二人计议， <u>天色已晚，别无甚话。</u>
Cheng versions	二人计议已定。

The examples in Table 5 correspond exactly with the briefer Cheng versions, and the underlined parts in Yu-cheng, Geng Chen, and Yu versions are not represented in the Yangs' translation. What is noteworthy is that Example 7 and Example 14 bear more than one variation, and they all correspond with Cheng versions, not Yu-cheng, Geng Chen and Yu versions. For instance, in Example 7, "uphold the right" corresponds with "以扶善良" in Cheng versions, not with "以救孤寡" (help the widow and orphan) in Yu-cheng, Geng Chen and Yu versions. In the same example, "both the living and the dead" corresponds not with "死者" (the dead) in Yu-cheng, Geng Chen and Yu versions, but with "存歿" in Cheng versions. In Example 14, the underlined parts in Yu-cheng, Geng Chen and Yu versions are missing in the Yangs' translation. In the Yangs' translation, "small girls" is equivalent to "幼女" in Cheng versions, not to "五六岁的儿女" in Yu-cheng, Geng Chen and Yu versions, and "They keep them till they're twelve or thirteen" corresponds with "养至十二三岁" in Cheng versions, not with "到十一二岁时" (until they are eleven or twelve) in Yu-cheng, Geng Chen and Yu versions.

After establishing the fact that the 1974 excerpts correspond with Cheng versions, we are to move one step further to compare Cheng A and Cheng B versions, thus establishing the identity of the original version of 1974 excerpts (Table 6).



Table 6. Differences between Cheng A and Cheng B Versions

Example 17	
1974 version	Injure one and you injure them all, honour one and you honour them all. This Hsueh charged with manslaughter is one of the Hsuehs on that list.
Cheng A version	一损俱损 一荣俱荣 <u>扶持遮饰 皆有照应的</u> 今告打死人之薛就是丰年大雪之薛
Cheng B version	一损俱损，一荣俱荣，今告打死人之薛，就是[丰年大雪]之[薛].....
Example 18	
1974 version	But then, no doubt as retribution for entanglements in a former life, <u>he no sooner set eyes on this girl than he fell for her</u> and made up his mind to buy her, swearing to have no more to do with men and to take no other wife. That was why, to show that he was really in earnest, he insisted on her coming to him three days later...Then young Hsueh ordered his men to beat Feng Yuan into a pulp.
Cheng A version	这也是前生冤孽 <u>可巧遇见这拐子买丫头</u> 他便一眼看上了这丫头 立意买来作妾 设誓不近男色 也不再取第二个了 所以郑重其事 必待三日后方进门那薛公子 <u>岂肯让人的</u> 便喝令下人动手将冯公子打了个稀烂
Cheng B version	这也是前生冤孽: <u>可巧遇见这丫头</u> ，他便一眼看上了，立意买来作妾，设誓不近男色，也不再取第二个了，所以郑重其事，必得三日后方进门那薛公子便喝令下人动手，将冯公子打了个稀烂.....
Example 19	
1974 version	Young Hsueh had already fixed on a day to set off for the capital. So having <u>killed a man</u> and carried off a girl, he set off with his household as if nothing had happened—he wasn't running away.
Cheng A version	这薛公子原早择下日子要上京去的 <u>既打了冯公子</u> 夺了丫头 他便如没事人一般 只管带了家眷走他的路 并非为此而逃
Cheng B version	这薛公子原择下日子要上京的， <u>既打了人</u> ，夺了丫头，他便如没事人一般，只管带了家眷走他的路，并非为此而逃.....

Table 6 presents the evidences that the Yangs' translation corresponds with the briefer Cheng B version, instead of Cheng A version. In Example 17, the underlined part of Cheng A version “扶持遮饰 皆有照应的” (They help each other and cover up for each other) does not appear in the Yangs' translation. In Example 18, the Yangs' translation “he no sooner set eyes on this girl than he fell for her” corresponds with “可巧遇见这丫头，他便一眼看上了这丫头” in Cheng B version, instead of “可巧遇见这拐子买丫头 他便一眼看上了这丫头” (he ran into this kidnapper selling the girl and no sooner set eyes on this girl) in Cheng A version. The texts of Cheng A and Cheng B versions in Example 19 show some minor differences, “打了冯公子” (meaning killing Feng Yuan in the story) in Cheng A version and “打了人” (meaning killing a man) in Cheng B version. This proves that even minor differences can help identify the exact version used by the translators.



4.3 Original version(s) of the 1977 excerpts

Four chapters of the Yangs' translation of *HLM* (Issue 11: chapters 27 and 28; Issue 12: chapters 40 and 41) were published in Issues 11 and 12 of *Chinese Literature* (1977). In this part, 1977 excerpts were collated with the original versions used in the study, to ascertain their original version(s). Only Chapter 27 from Issue 11 and Chapter 40 from Issue 12 are discussed in details, as representatives of 1977 excerpts, with the remaining chapters summarized briefly.

Table 7. The 1977 Excerpts and Corresponding Parts in Original Versions

Example 20	
1977 version	"If I do, may a boil break out <u>in my mouth</u> and may I die a miserable death!"
Yu-cheng /Geng Chen /Yu versions	我要告诉一个人就长一个疔，日后不得好死！
Cheng versions	我要告诉人， <u>嘴上</u> 就长一个疔，日后不得好死！
Example 21	
1977 version	You know, sister-in-law, I told her mother,...
Yu-cheng /Geng Chen /Yu versions	因说道， <u>既这么肯跟我</u> ，还和他妈说.....
Cheng versions	因说，嫂子不知道，我和他妈说.....
Example 22	
1977 version	"Won't you wait for <u>Master Pao</u> ?" Asked the maid.
Yu-cheng /Geng Chen /Yu versions	那丫头说，“等着 <u>宝玉</u> 一块儿走。”
Cheng versions	那丫头说，“等着 <u>宝二爷</u> 一块儿走。”
Example 23	
1977 version	By the way, I've something to ask you. In your honourable company there's an actor called Chi-kuan who's known all over the country, but I've never had a chance to see him.
Yu-cheng /Geng Chen /Yu versions	还有一句话借问，也是你们贵班中有一个叫琪官的， <u>他在那里</u> ？如今名驰天下，我独无缘一见。
Cheng versions	还有一句话借问，也是你们贵班中，有一个叫琪官的，如今名驰天下，可惜我独无缘一见。
Example 24	
1977 version	"Madam Lien sent over for <u>Hsiao-hung</u>"
Yu-cheng /Geng Chen /Yu versions	二奶奶打发人叫了 <u>红玉</u> 去了。
Cheng versions	二奶奶打发人叫了 <u>小红</u> 去了。
Example 25	
1977 version	There are several different designs—sprays of blossom, <u>floating clouds and</u>



	<u>bats</u> ...the colours so vivid and the gauze so soft, I've never seen anything like it...
Yu-cheng /Geng Chen /Yu versions	也有 <u>流云</u> <u>已福</u> 花样的颜色又鲜，纱又轻软，我竟没见过这样的。
Cheng versions	也有 <u>流云</u> <u>蝙蝠</u> 花样的颜色又鲜，纱又轻软，我竟没见过这样的。
Example 26	
1977 version	A stop was put to this discussion by the arrival of <u>Wen-kuan with Hsiang-ling, Ssu-chi and Tai-shu.</u>
Yu-cheng version	二人正说者 只见文官 香菱 司棋 待书等上亭子来了
Geng Chen /Yu versions	二人正说着，只见 <u>文官、香菱、司棋、待书</u> 等上亭子来了。
Cheng versions	二人正说着，只见 <u>香菱、臻儿、司棋、待书</u> 等上亭子来了。
Example 27	
1977 version	Then, having drunk up, <u>he picked up a piece of chicken.</u> “A cock crows at the moon by the rustic inn,” was his quotation.
Yu-cheng version	唱完 饮了门杯 <u>便拈起一片鸡肉</u> 说道 鸡声茅店月
Geng Chen /Cheng A versions	唱完，饮了门杯，说道：【 <u>鸡鸣茅店月</u> 】。
Yu/ Cheng B versions	唱完，饮了门杯，说道：【 <u>鸡声茅店月</u> 】。
Example 28	
1977 version	“I'm old now, but when I was young I was flighty too and <u>fond of flowers.</u> ” chuckled Granny Liu. “So it's right I should be an old flibberitigibbet today.”
Yu-cheng version	刘姥姥笑道 我虽老了 年轻时也风流 <u>爱个花儿的</u> 今日老风流才好
Geng Chen version	刘姥姥笑道 我虽老了 年轻时也风流 <u>爱个花儿粉儿的</u> 今日老风流才好
Yu version	刘姥姥笑道：【我虽老了，年轻时也风流， <u>爱个花儿粉儿的</u> ，今儿老风流才好。】
Cheng versions	刘姥姥笑道：【我虽老了，年轻时也风流， <u>爱个花儿粉儿的</u> ，今儿索性作个老风流！】

The titles of Chapter 27 in different original versions of this study are the same “滴翠亭杨妃戏彩蝶 埋香冢飞燕泣残红”. This title is translated as “Pao-chai Chases a Butterfly to Dripping Emerald Pavillion Tai-yu Weeps over Fallen Blossom by the Tomb of Flowers” in Yangs’ translation, with the metaphorical “杨妃” and “飞燕” translated according to the content into “Pao-chai” and “Tai-yu” respectively. The beginning of Chapter 27 in the 1977 excerpt indicates that the original version is not Cheng B version, with the differentiating sentence “So tonight they withdrew to bed” corresponding to “只管睡觉去” in Yu-cheng, Yu, Geng Chen and Cheng A version, not to “只管外间自便去了” in Cheng B version. The ending “Pao-yu, listening, was overwhelmed with grief” corresponds to “宝玉听了，不觉痴倒” in Yu-cheng, Yu, Geng Chen, and Cheng A versions, not to “正是一面低吟，一面哽



咽，那边哭的自己伤心，却不道这边听的早已痴倒了” in Cheng B version. Therefore, it could be inferred that the beginning and ending of Chapter 27 are no longer following Cheng B version, and there is a change of original versions in the Yangs’ translation of *HLM* between 1974 and 1977.

Then, the details of the 1977 excerpts were closely examined and compared with the different original versions. The collation results illustrate a complicated picture of the original versions (Table 7). On the one hand, in Examples 21 and 23, the underlined parts in Yu-cheng, Geng Chen, and Yu versions are missing in the 1977 excerpts. Also, the underlined parts in Examples 20, 22, 24, and 25 correspond with the underlined parts in Cheng versions. Hence, it could be concluded that Examples 20-25 in the 1977 excerpts are based on Cheng versions. On the other hand, some examples indicate that the Yangs referred to Yu-cheng version too. For instance, in Example 26, the names of serving maids vary from Wen-kuan (文官) in Yu-cheng, Geng Chen and Yu versions, and Zhen’er (臻儿) in Cheng versions, to Tai-shu (待书) in Yu-cheng version, and Shishu (侍书) in Geng Chen, Yu, and Cheng versions. In the Yangs’ translation, the names of these serving maids correspond with those in Yu-cheng version. In Example 27, Yu-cheng version differs from all the other collated versions in that it has an extra “便拈起一片鸡肉说道”, which is translated into “he picked up a piece of chicken” in the Yangs’ translation. In Example 28, all original versions have “爱个花儿粉儿的” (fond of wearing flowers and powder) except Yu-cheng version which has “爱个花儿的” (fond of wearing flowers). The Yangs’ translation of “fond of flowers” corresponds with Yu-cheng version.

Examination of the 1977 excerpts reveals that cross-reference to the original versions is an obvious phenomenon in finalizing the contents of the Yangs’ translation of *HLM*. Besides Cheng versions and Yu-cheng version, the 1977 excerpts also make references to either Yu version or Geng Chen version. With these two versions heavily overlapped, it is not possible to identify the exact original version from the examples in the 1977 excerpts. For example, in Chapter 40, ““We must see if there’s any more of the blue,” said the Lady Dowager. ‘If there is, give a couple of rolls to Granny Liu, and I’d like to have a bedcurtain made with it.’” This corresponds to the texts in Geng Chen and Yu versions “贾母道：【再找一找，只怕还有青的。若有时都拿出来，送这刘亲家两疋，做一个帐子我挂……】”，not to the texts in Yu-cheng “贾母道 再找一找 只怕还有青的 若有时都拿出来 送这刘亲家两疋 做一个帐子挂……” or in Cheng versions “贾母道：【再找一找，只怕还有；要有，就都拿出来，送这刘亲家两匹。有雨过天青的，我做一帐子挂上】”。Another example, in Chapter 41, after Hsi-jen discovered Granny Liu was sleeping on Pao-yu’s bed “Hsi-jen signed to her to keep quiet, not wanting to disturb others for fear Pao-yu should come to hear of this. Hurriedly she thrust several handfuls of incense into the large tripod and replaced the cover, then straightened things a little in the room. It was lucky at least that the old woman hadn’t been sick”. This corresponds to Geng Chen and Yu versions’ “袭人恐惊动了人，被宝玉知道了，只向他摇手，不叫他说话。忙将当地大鼎内贮了三四把合香，仍用罩子罩上。些须收拾收拾，所喜不曾呕吐”。



5. Original Version(s) of the 1978 Version

The Yangs' complete translation of *HLM* was published by the Foreign Languages Press in China in 1978 and 1980 in three volumes. The Yangs' 1978 version were collated first with 1964, 1974, 1977 excerpts, to identify whether there are any differences between them, and second with Yu-cheng, Geng Chen, Yu, and Cheng versions, to identify the original versions.

Table 8. Comparison of Title and Beginning of Chapter 18 between the 1964 and the 1978 Versions

Example 29 Title of Chapter 18	
1978 version	Yuan-chun Visits Her Parents on the Feast of Lanterns Tai-yu Helps Her True Love by Passing Him a Poem
1964 version	Yuan-chun Returns to Lord Jung's Mansion to Visit Her Parents They Celebrate the Feast of Lanterns
Yu-cheng version	庆元宵贾元春归省 助情人林黛玉传诗
Geng Chen version / Yu version (Chapter 17 and 18 not divided)	大观园试才题对额 荣国府归省庆元宵
Cheng versions	皇恩重元妃省父母 天伦乐宝玉呈才藻
Example 30 Beginning of Chapter 18	
1978 version	As soon as Pao-yu was out of the courtyard, the pages who attended Chia Cheng stepped forward to throw their arms around his waist.
1964 version	For Lady Wang and her helpers the days passed in a flurry of preparations until, towards the end of the tenth month, all was ready.
Yu-cheng version	却说宝玉来至院外 就有跟贾政的几个小厮上来 拦腰抱住
Geng Chen version / Yu version (Chapter 17 and 18 not divided)	/
Cheng versions	话说彼时有人回，工程上等着糊东西的纱绫，请凤姐去开库；又有人来回，请凤姐收金银器皿。

First, the title and beginning of Chapter 18 are different between the 1964 and 1978 versions. In terms of the title, the 1978 version presents both the information about Yuan-chun's visiting on Feast of Lanterns and Tai-yu's helping Pao-yu by passing him a poem, and it corresponds with the texts in



Yu-cheng version. Geng Chen and Yu versions do not have a title for Chapter 18, because Chapters 17 & 18 are not divided in these two versions. In Cheng versions, the title presents the same information about Yuan-chun's home returning in the first half, and Pao-yu's literary talent by composing inscriptions in the second half. It could be concluded that the Yangs used Yu-cheng version to translate the title of Chapter 18 in their 1978 version of *HLM*. In Example 30, in Yu-cheng version Chapter 18 starts with Pao-yu withdrew to the outside, where he was met by several pages who attended on Chia Cheng, and this beginning was faithfully translated by the Yangs in their 1978 version. The Cheng versions starts Chapter 18 with Wang Hsi-feng being requested to open the storeroom for gauze and silk, as well as to store away the gold and silver utensils. The endings of the Chapter 18 in 1964 and 1978 versions are almost the same, with the exception of changing the wording such as "imperial rules" vs. "imperial regulations", and "the sedan-chair" vs. "her palanquin". It is obvious that in the 1978 version, the Yangs followed Yu-cheng version to divide Chapter 17 and 18, which they didn't in the 1964 excerpts. The titles, beginnings and endings of Chapters 19 and 20 bear no sufficient difference to trace the corresponding parts in the 1978 version, so they are not analyzed here.

Besides the title and beginning of Chapter 18, more examples indicate that the 1978 version is different from the corresponding parts in 1964 and 1974 excerpts, and Yu-cheng version was used as the original version. In Chapter 18, among the presents given by The Imperial Consort Yuan-chun, each of the girls in the Chia Household received "one new book, a rare mirror and two pairs of gold and silver trinkets of a new design". "A rare mirror" corresponds with "宝镜一方" in Yu-cheng version, not the "宝砚一方" ("a rare inkstone" in 1964 version) in Yu version. In Chapter 19, when describing the dangers involved for Pao-yu coming to visit at her home, Hsi-jen said, "The streets are jammed with people and carriages and if your horse bolted you could quite easily have an accident". This sentence differs from the 1964 version in the part after the first "and", and it corresponds with "街上人挤车碰 马有个闪失 也是难得的" in Yu-cheng version. In the same chapter, when Pao-yu expressed the "nice" idea of having Hsi-jen's cousin live with them in the Chia mansion, Hsi-jen responded "'Nice, you call it?' His-jen snorted. 'Nice to be a slave here?'". This corresponds with Yu-cheng version "袭人冷笑道 实在好的 该给你家作奴才么".

Several examples from Chapter 4 of the 1978 version point to the fact that what was translated using Cheng B version in 1974 was re-translated following Yu-cheng version. For example, when Feng Yuan's death was brought to the court of Yingtien, the plaintiff begged the prefect Chia Yu-tsun that "I beg Your Honour to arrest the criminals, punish the evil-doers and help the widow and orphan. Then both the living and the dead will be everlastingly grateful". The underlined part here corresponds only with Yu-cheng's "剪恶除凶 以救孤寡", and it did not appear in the 1974 excerpts. Also, when Chia Yu-tsun first saw the Official's Protective Charm, "It was a doggerel catalogue of the most notable families in that district with notes on their ancestry, ranks and family branches. It started off". The underlined part is missing in the 1974 excerpts, and it corresponds with Yu-cheng's "下面皆注着始祖官爵并房次", which is different from Geng Chen and Yu versions' "下面皆注着始祖官爵并房次, 石头亦曾抄写了一张, 今据石上所抄", and the Cheng versions do not have the corresponding content. Accordingly, the detailed information about the ancestry, ranks and family branches missing in the 1974 excerpts was translated in italicized form in the 1978 version. In the 1978 version of the Charm,



the section about Shihs of Chinling reads “Twenty branches descended from Marquis Shih of Paoling, Prime Minister”, and branch number “twenty” corresponds with Yu-cheng’s “保龄侯尚书令史公之后房分共二十”, while the corresponding information in Yu version is eighteen “保龄侯尚书令史公之后, 房分共十八 (eighteen)”. Third, when commenting on Feng Yuan’s fate, the attendant said “Feng Yuan dreamed of happiness, but instead of finding it he lost his life” in the 1978 version, while in the 1974 version, it was “Feng Yuan dreamed of happiness, but instead of finding it he lost both his money and his life”. The difference here indicates the change in the original versions: the 1978 version was based on Yu-cheng’s “这冯公子空喜一场 一念未遂 反花了性命”, the 1974 version on Cheng B version’s “这冯公子空喜一场, 一念未遂, 反花了钱, 送了性命”.

When collating the 1977 excerpts with 1978 version, we have also discovered that in spite of the high level of agreement, these two versions hold some important differences, and these differences shed light on the finalization of the Yangs’ translation of *HLM* (Table 9). In Example 31, the 1977 and 1978 versions vary in the order of the first two characters. The 1977 version has “Lady Wang, Lord Cheng”, which corresponds with Yu-cheng, Geng Chen and Yu versions, while the 1978 version has “Lord Cheng, Lady Wang”, which corresponds with Cheng versions.

Table 9. Changes between the 1977 Excerpts and 1978 Version and Corresponding Original Contents

Example 31	
1977 version	<u>Lady Wang, Lord Cheng</u> and Madam Hsueh each had an extra sandalwood sceptre...
1978 version	<u>Lord Cheng, Lady Wang</u> and Madam Hsueh each had an extra sandalwood sceptre...
Yu-cheng/Geng Chen/Yu versions	太太老爷姨太太的只多的一个香如意
Cheng versions	老爷太太姨太太的只多的一个香玉如意
Example 32	
1977 version	“We must see if there’s any more of the blue,” said the Lady Dowager. “If there is, <u>give a couple of rolls to Granny Liu, and I’d like to have a bedcurtain made with it...</u> ”
1978 version	“We must see if there’s any more of the blue,” said the Lady Dowager. “If there is, <u>give a couple of rolls to Granny Liu to make a bedcurtain...</u> ”
Yu-cheng version	贾母道 再找一找 只怕还有青的 若有时都拿出来 送这刘亲家两疋 做一个帐子挂.....
Geng Chen/Yu versions	贾母道：【再找一找，只怕还有青的。若有时都拿出来，送这刘亲家两疋，做一个帐子我挂.....
Cheng versions	贾母道：【再找一找，只怕还有；要有，就都拿出来，送这刘亲家两匹。有雨过天青的，我做一个帐子挂上。】
Example 33	
1977 version	<u>Everyone burst out laughing</u> . All Yuan-yang could do was to have one large cup filled, and Granny Liu raised this in both hands to her lips.
1978 version	All Yuan-yang could do was to have one large cup filled, and Granny Liu raised this in both hands to her lips.



Yu-cheng version	鸳鸯等无法 只得命人满斟了一大杯 刘姥姥两手捧着喝干
Geng Chen/Yu/Cheng versions	说的众人又笑起来。鸳鸯等无法，只得命人满斟了一大杯，刘姥姥两手捧着喝。
Example 34	
1977 version	Before her was a pool <u>seven or eight feet</u> across, its banks paved with flag-stones, a clear green brook flowing through it, and lying across it a long slab of white stone.
1978 version	Before her was a pool <u>five or six feet</u> across, its banks paved with flag-stones, a clear green brook flowing through it, and lying across it a long slab of white stone.
Yu-cheng version	只见迎面忽有一带水池 只有 <u>五六尺</u> 宽 石头砌岸 里面碧清的水 流往那边去了 上面一块白石横架在上面
Geng Chen/Yu/Cheng versions	只见迎面一带水池，有 <u>七八尺</u> 宽，石头镶案，里面碧波清水上面有块白石横架。

It is obvious that, in spite of the fact that the Yangs based on Yu-cheng version to translate this sentence in the 1977 version, the Yangs referred to Cheng versions, most possibly Cheng B version for the order of these two characters, and the intention was to restore the patriarchal feature of the then Chinese society. In Example 32, the difference lies in whether Lady Dowager would make a bedcurtain or not. In the 1977 version, Lady Dowager said she would make a bedcurtain with the blue gauze (青的), which corresponds with Geng Chen and Yu versions (in Cheng versions Lady Dowager would make a bedcurtain with the gauze that has the colour of blue sky after a shower 雨过天青的). In the 1978 version, Lady Dowager mentioned to give a couple of blue gauze to Granny Liu to make a bedcurtain with, but no information about herself was presented. So, it is clear that in 1977 the Yangs based this sentence on either Geng Chen or Yu version, but in 1978 they referred to Yu-cheng version to finalize this sentence. Example 33 shows that the 1978 version omitted the sentence “Everyone burst out laughing” in the 1977 version, and this suggests that the Yangs referred to Yu-cheng version in their final stage of the work. The same pattern was repeated in Example 34, where the Yangs changed “seven or eight feet” in the 1977 version to “five or six feet” according to Yu-cheng version.

In 4.3 of the paper, we point out that Yu-cheng version is one of the important reference versions in the 1977 excerpts. In this part, by comparing the 1964, 1974 excerpts with the 1978 version, we note that in places where they are different from one another, the 1978 version is based on Yu-cheng version. With the short timespan between Issues 11 and 12 of 1977 excerpts and the 1978 complete version, it can be concluded that the 1977 and 1978 versions are based on Yu-cheng as the original version, and the Yangs also referred to other versions such as Cheng versions, Geng Chen or Yu versions to finalize the contents. The cross-reference to different original versions reflects both the translators’ and the Redologist’s efforts to construct a coherent and realistic story in translating *HLM*. For instance, in Example 27 of Table 7, the Yangs adopted Yu-cheng content to make the style of the game (writing four lines about a girl’s sorrow) coherent, and on the same page of the 1977 excerpts (*Chinese*



Literature, 1977 (11):97) the game continues with “She drain her cup and picked up a peach saying, ‘The peach trees are in blossom’”. In Example 28, Granny Liu, as a poor old country lady, is very much pleased to be dressed in flowers of different kinds, which makes her to recall her youth when she used to wear flowers to dress herself, which fits into the context of the story in Chapter 40 and Granny Liu’s background.

6. Analysis of the Reasons for the Changes in Original Versions and their Impacts

In this study, we have outlined the changes of original versions at the different stages of the Yangs’ translation of *HLM*, and that is: the 1964 excerpts are based on Yu version, the 1974 excerpts on Cheng B version, and the 1977, 1978 versions are based on Yu-cheng version, with references to Cheng versions and Geng Chen or Yu versions. To analyze the underlying reasons, both the social background and the Yangs’ working modes in the translation of *HLM* need to be taken seriously. The reason for using Yu version as the original version was mentioned both in Yang’s letter to Qin Ying and in the interview with Qian Duoxiu & E.S.P. Almberg. This choice was the result of Jiang Qing’s mandate in the 1960s, and translators like the Yangs had to follow the political orders. This explains why the 1964 excerpts are based on Yu versions. In the years of 1972-1974, although the Cultural Revolution was not finished, the Yangs were in the process of finishing the translation of *HLM* as a whole of 120 chapters, resuming their work after a 7/8-year interruption. Cheng B version, instead of Cheng A version was then a popular and shorter version of *HLM*, and it was published by the People’s Literature Publishing House in 1957, 1959, 1964, and 1973 respectively. These years fall into the time framework of the Yangs’ translation of *HLM*. The popularity and availability guaranteed that Cheng B version was chosen as the original version for the Yangs’ translation of *HLM* in the 1970s. In the late 1970s, when the Yangs’ translation of *HLM* was to be finalized, Redologist (红学家) Wu Shichang, who worked as the English editor of the Yangs’ translation of *HLM*, participated in the process of deciding the final contents, and in this process, Yu-cheng version was used as the main original version, while at the same time Cheng versions, Yu or Geng Chen version were referred to. It is evident that, throughout the journey of the Yangs’ translating of *HLM*, especially in terms of the changes over the original versions, both the translators and the redologist were subject to political interference in the 1960s-1970s.

Literary translation is a process of recreation, where the merits of the work are retained in the incarnation of the novel. However, when the translators lose the freedom to choose what to translate, they actually work as if they were “dancing with shackles”, and this can negatively impact on the image and reputation of translated texts. In the specific example of the Yangs’ translation of *HLM*, the 1964 and 1974 excerpts show high level of faithfulness to the original texts, which makes the translation blunt to read, thus losing the novel’s literary and artistic touch. However, in the late 1970s, when the Cultural Revolution came to an end, the translators welcomed greater freedom, and Redologist Wu Shichang joined the translators in the final decision of the contents. As a result, the Yang’s translation of *HLM* is easy to read, more coherent in theme and culture, thus restoring the novel’s literary charm. For instance, in Chapter 18, when Yuan-chun was about to arrive at Rong Mansion in her home-bound visit, the 1964 excerpts are “At this signal the other eunuchs rushed to their posts” (Yu version: 这些太



监会意，都知道是来了，各按方向站住)，while the 1978 version has “At this signal the other eunuchs said, ‘Her Highness is coming!’ They all rushed to their posts” (Yu-cheng version:这些太监会意 都知道说 来了来了 各按方向站住). The 1978 version used Yu-cheng version as the original version here, which uses the reaction of eunuchs (会意), their reminding remarks “来了来了”, and activities “各按方向站住” to vividly depict the quick arrangement of solemnness after a long wait for the arrival of “Her Highness”. The 1964 excerpts used Yu version as the original version, which is actually a reductive and flat depiction of the situation. Another example is from Chapter 19. When Hsi-jen heard that her mother and brother would buy her out, the 1978 version has “she had assured them that Pao-yu would never let her go so long as he lived”, and the 1964 version has “she had sworn never to go home so long as she lived”, an excuse from the perspective of Hsi-jen: she would rather die than go home, which was not in agreement with, and thus distorted the image of Hsi-jen in the novel. Differences of similar nature can be found in the 1964, 1974 excerpts and corresponding contents in the 1978 version. They first confirm the change of the original versions, thus secondly affirm the influence of such change on the image of the novel as a whole. When the translators and specialist enjoyed freedom in deciding what to translate, they established an eclectic version of the novel to transcend the available versions, and to restore the original charm of the novel, which was observed in the 1977 excerpts and in the differences between 1977 and 1978 versions.

7. Conclusion

In this study, we have established the identity of the original versions of the Yangs’ excerpts of *HLM* at different stages of their translation. With this, it could be concluded that the reason for different parties to present conflicting statements about the original versions is that different parties actually referred to different stages of the translation: Yang Xianyi was referring to stage 1 of the translation work in the 1960s when he and his wife were forced to re-translate the work according to Yu version; the *Publisher’s Note* was right in terms of the original versions for the 1978 version that the first 80 chapters were based on Yu-cheng version, as the direct result of Redologist Wu Shichang’s involvement in deciding the final contents (the publishing year of this Yu-cheng version was in 1975, not 1973 as indicated in the Publisher’s Note). The statements of *Renmin Ribao* and Wu Shichang could not be verified in the study. In addition, this study only considers and analyzes the first 80 chapters in this research, and the original version(s) of the last 40 chapters are not covered.

By establishing the identity of the original versions used by the Yangs at different stages, we have also depicted the process of their translation work. To translate such a culture-loaded novel as *HLM* into English, the mode of cooperation between the translators (Chinese together with native English) and the Redologists is an ideal way to help the novel go beyond the national boundaries. However, when the translators and Redologists are put in a servile and powerless working environment, the translated work tends to be reductive, a shadow of the original, without addressing the totality and literary values, as observed in the 1964 and 1974 excerpt. Once the translators and literary experts are given freedom and initiative in their work, the translated work projects a better image, and this is observed in the differences among the 1978 version, 1964 version and 1974 version. Therefore, in the current national project to promote Chinese classics to the international stage, the cooperation between



the translators and experts on these classics is essential to guarantee the quality of the translated texts. Moreover, the translators and experts should be given high degree of autonomy in the working process.

Declarations and Acknowledgement:

The authors declare there is no conflict of interest.

References

- Hawkes, David. [1980] 1989. *The Translator, the Mirror and the Dream--Some Observations on a New Theory. Classical, Modern and Humane*. Edited by John Minford & Siu-kit Wong. Hong Kong: The Chinese University Press.
- Hong, Tao. 2010. *Female Body and Nation Building*. Beijing: National Library of China Publishing House.
- Li, Jing. 2012. On the Impacts of External Factors on the Yangs' Choice of the Original Versions in Translating *HLM*. *Studies on "A Dream of Red Mansions"*, 6:196-216.
- Li, Jing. 2013. A Study on the Original Versions used by Yang Xianyi and Gladys Yang in their Translation of *Hong Lou Meng*: Proofs from Dietary and Medicine. *Studies on "A Dream of Red Mansions"* (6): 269-293.
- Li, Jing. 2014. A Study on the Original Versions used by Yang Xianyi and Gladys Yang in their Translation of *Hong Lou Meng*: Proofs from Poetry, Calligraphy and Painting. *Cao Xue Qin Studies* (4):125-142.
- Li, Jing. 2015. The Yangs' Original Version Used in Translating *Hong Lou Meng* is not Yu Version. *Studies on Cao Xueqin*, 4:131-143.
- Li, Jing. 2020. *A Study of the Original Version(s) Used by Yang Xianyi and Gladys Yang in their Translation of Hong Lou Meng*. Beijing: Culture and Art Publishing House.
- Tsao, Hsueh-chin. 1958. *A Dream of Red Mansions* (Yu version). Beijing: People's Literature Publishing House.
- Tsao, Hsueh-chin. 1964. *Deam of the Red Chamber*, translated by Yang Xianyi & Gladys Yang. *Chinese Literature* (Issue 6): 40-82.
- Tsao, Hsueh-chin. 1974. *Deam of the Red Chamber*, translated by Yang Xianyi & Gladys Yang. *Chinese Literature* (Issue 5): 95-101.
- Tsao, Hsueh-chin. 1977. *Deam of the Red Chamber*, translated by Yang Xianyi & Gladys Yang. *Chinese Literature* (Issue 11): 70-107.
- Tsao, Hsueh-chin. 1974. *Deam of the Red Chamber*, translated by Yang Xianyi & Gladys Yang. *Chinese Literature* (Issue 12): 55-92.
- Tsao, Hsueh-chin. 1975. *A Dream of Red Mansions* (Yu-cheng version). Beijing: People's Literature Publishing House.
- Tsao, Hsueh-chin. 2014. *A Dream of Red Mansions* (Cheng A version). Beijing: China Bookstore.
- Tsao, Hsueh-chin & Kao Ngo. 1973. *A Dream of Red Mansions* (Cheng B version). Beijing: People's Literature Publishing House.
- Tsao, Hsueh-chin & Kao Ngo. 1978. *A Dream of Red Mansions* (V. I-II). translated by Yang Hsien-yi and Gladys Yang. Peking: Foreign Languages Press.
- Tsao, Hsueh-chin. 2009. *Shi Tou Ji*, reannotated by Zhi Yan Zhai (Jia Xu Version). Beijing: People's Literature Publishing House.
- Tsao, Hsueh-chin. 2009. *Shi Tou Ji*, reannotated by Zhi Yan Zhai (Geng Chen Version). Beijing: People's Literature Publishing House.



- Qian, Duoxiu & E.S.P. Almberg. 2001. Interview with Yang Xianyi. *Translation Review*, 62:1,17-25.
- Qin, Ying. 2016. *Zoom Lens*. Beijing: SDX Joint Publishing Company.
- Renmin Ribao*, 1979. May 8. Tuesday: page 4.
- Wang, Jinbo. 2019. A Study on the Original Version Used by Yang Xianyi & Gladys Yang in Translating *Hong Lou Meng*. *Studies on "A Dream of Red Mansions"* (2): 260-282.
- Wei, Shaochang. 1982. *On the Versions of Hong Lou Meng*. Beijing: Chinese Social Science Publishing House.
- Wu, Shichang. 1980. Are the Ning Mansion and Jung Mansion nothing but a slaughter house? *Dushu* (1),78-83.
- Wu, Yuanqiong & Natalia Fernández Díaz. 2017. *Asian Pacific Translation and Intercultural Studies* (4:3), 236-252.
- Yang, Xianyi. 2002. *White Tiger: An Autobiography of Yang Xianyi*. Hong Kong: The Chinese University Press.

Note: The original versions have different styles, some in simplified Chinese, some in ancient Chinese. When the study cites these original versions, we unify the style into simplified Chinese. Also, the sources of the examples used in tables are not indicated in the study, for the consideration of brevity and neatness. However, if otherwise, the sources are identified.

About the Authors:

Wu Yuanqiong, associate professor at School of Foreign Languages in Shanghai University of Engineering Science, Shanghai, China. Her research areas mainly include teaching English as a foreign/second language, cross-cultural communication and translation studies. Recently, she focuses her interest on the translation studies of the classical Chinese novel *Hong Lou Meng*.

Liu Xiaomin, professor at School of Foreign Languages in Shanghai University of Engineering Science, Shanghai, China. His research areas mainly include teaching English as a foreign/second language, and translation studies. He has a long-term research interest in classical Chinese literature *Hong Lou Meng* and its translations.



This work is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/)

© 2022 All Terrain Publishing